

**United States District Court  
District of Massachusetts (Boston)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:17-cv-12022-FDS**

Commonwealth of Massachusetts et al v. United States  
Department of Homeland Security et al  
Assigned to: Judge F. Dennis Saylor, IV  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 10/17/2017  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of  
Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**Commonwealth of Massachusetts**

represented by **Conor P. Duffy**  
New York State Office of the Attorney  
General  
Civil Rights Bureau  
28 Liberty St  
20th FL  
New York, NY 10005  
(212) 416-8637  
Email: [conor.duffy@ag.ny.gov](mailto:conor.duffy@ag.ny.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jonathan Sclarsic**  
Massachusetts Attorney General's Office  
One Ashburton Place  
McCormack Building, 20th floor  
Boston, MA 02108-1598  
617-963-2045  
Email: [jonathan.sclarsic@state.ma.us](mailto:jonathan.sclarsic@state.ma.us)  
*TERMINATED: 08/08/2018*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kevin W. Manganaro**  
Massachusetts Attorney General's Office  
One Ashburton Place  
McCormack Building, 20th floor  
Boston, MA 02108-1598  
516-241-5521  
Email: [kmanganaro@hinshawlaw.com](mailto:kmanganaro@hinshawlaw.com)  
*TERMINATED: 01/22/2019*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sara A. Colb**  
Office of the Attorney General  
One Ashburton Place  
Boston, MA 02108  
617-963-2031  
Email: [sara.colb@state.ma.us](mailto:sara.colb@state.ma.us)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**State of California**

represented by **Satoshi Yanai**  
California Department of Justice  
300 S. Spring Street  
Suite 1702  
Los Angeles, CA 90013  
(213) 269-6400  
Email: [satoshi.yanai@doj.ca.gov](mailto:satoshi.yanai@doj.ca.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*PRO HAC VICE*

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Jonathan Sclarsic**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 08/08/2018*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Plaintiff**

**District of Columbia**

represented by **Robyn R Bender**  
Office of the Attorney General for the Dist  
of Columbia  
441 4th Street NW  
Suite 50 South  
Washington, DC 20001  
(202) 724-6610  
Email: [robyn.bender@dc.gov](mailto:robyn.bender@dc.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Valerie M Nannery**  
Office of the Attorney General for the  
District of Columbia  
441 4th Street, NW  
Suite 600 South  
Washington, DC 20001  
(202) 442-9596  
Email: [valerie.nannery@dc.gov](mailto:valerie.nannery@dc.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Jonathan Sclarsic**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 08/08/2018*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Plaintiff**

**State of Hawaii**

represented by **Stella M.L. Kam**  
Administrative Division, Dept of the  
Attorney General  
425 Queen Street  
Honolulu, HI 96813  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Jonathan Sclarsic**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 08/08/2018*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Plaintiff**

**State of Iowa**

represented by **Nathan Blake**  
Iowa Attorney General  
1305 E. Walnut Street  
Des Moines, IA 50319  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Jonathan Sclarsic**  
(See above for address)

**TERMINATED: 08/08/2018**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Plaintiff**

**State of Illinois**

represented by **Caitlyn McEllis**  
Office of the Attorney General  
100 W. Randolph st  
11th Floor  
Chicago, IL 60601  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jonathan Scarsic**  
(See above for address)  
**TERMINATED: 08/08/2018**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Plaintiff**

**State of Maryland**

represented by **Steven M Sullivan**  
Office of the Attorney General  
200 Saint Paul Place  
Baltimore, MD 21202  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jonathan Scarsic**  
(See above for address)  
**TERMINATED: 08/08/2018**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Plaintiff**

**State of New York**

represented by **State of New York**  
Attorney General  
120 Broadway  
23rd Floor  
New York, NY 10271  
212-416-6030  
Email: [lourdes.rosado@ag.ny.gov](mailto:lourdes.rosado@ag.ny.gov)  
PRO SE

**Lourdes M Rosado**  
NY State Office of the Attorney General  
120 Broadway  
23rd Floor  
New York, NY 10023  
212-416-8252  
**TERMINATED: 03/28/2019**  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jonathan Scarsic**  
(See above for address)  
**TERMINATED: 08/08/2018**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Plaintiff**

**State of Oregon**

represented by **Scott Kaplan**  
Oregon Dept of Justice  
100 SW Market Street

Portland, OR 97201  
971-673-1880  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jonathan Scarsic**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 08/08/2018*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**State of Washington**

represented by **Chalia Stallings Ala'Ilima**  
Washington State Attorney General's  
Office  
800 Fifth Avenue  
Suite 2000  
Seattle, WA 98104  
206-326-5480  
Email: [chalias@atg.wa.gov](mailto:chalias@atg.wa.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jonathan Scarsic**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 08/08/2018*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**United States Department of Homeland  
Security**

represented by **Anita Johnson**  
United States Attorney's Office  
John Joseph Moakley Federal Courthouse  
Suite 9200  
1 Courthouse Way  
Boston, MA 02210  
617-748-3100  
Email: [anita.johnson@usdoj.gov](mailto:anita.johnson@usdoj.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**United States Immigration and  
Customs Enforcement**  
*Division of the Department of Homeland  
Security*

represented by **Anita Johnson**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**United States Citizenship and  
Immigration Services**

represented by **Anita Johnson**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**United States Customs and Border  
Protection**

represented by **Anita Johnson**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
10/17/2017	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against All Defendants Filing fee: \$ 400, receipt number 0101-6843571 (Fee Status: Filing Fee paid), filed by COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS, District of Columbia, State of California, State of Hawaii, State of Illinois, State of Iowa, State of Maryland, State of New York, State of Oregon, State of Washington. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet # <u>2</u> Category Form, # <u>3</u> Summons)(Sclarsic, Jonathan) ( <b>Attachment 1 replaced on 10/17/2017 due to fillable format</b> ) (DaSilva, Carolina). ( <b>Attachment 2 replaced on 10/17/2017 due to fillable format</b> ) (DaSilva, Carolina). ( <b>Attachment 3 replaced on 10/17/2017 due to fillable format</b> ) (DaSilva, Carolina). (Entered: 10/17/2017)
10/17/2017	<u>2</u>	ELECTRONIC NOTICE of Case Assignment. Judge F. Dennis Saylor, IV assigned to case. If the trial Judge issues an Order of Reference of any matter in this case to a Magistrate Judge, the matter will be transmitted to Magistrate Judge Donald L. Cabell. (Caruso, Stephanie) (Entered: 10/17/2017)
10/17/2017	<u>3</u>	Summons Issued as to United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Homeland Security, United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement. <b>Counsel receiving this notice electronically should download this summons, complete one for each defendant and serve it in accordance with Fed.R.Civ.P. 4 and LR 4.1. Summons will be mailed to plaintiff(s) not receiving notice electronically for completion of service.</b> (DaSilva, Carolina) (Entered: 10/17/2017)
12/01/2017	<u>4</u>	SUMMONS Returned Executed United States Citizenship and Immigration Services served on 10/23/2017, answer due 11/13/2017; United States Customs and Border Protection served on 10/23/2017, answer due 11/13/2017; United States Department of Homeland Security served on 10/23/2017, answer due 11/13/2017; United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement served on 10/27/2017, answer due 11/17/2017. (Sclarsic, Jonathan) (Entered: 12/01/2017)
12/04/2017	<u>5</u>	ELECTRONIC NOTICE of Hearing. Status Conference set for 1/11/2018 02:00 PM in Courtroom 2 before Judge F. Dennis Saylor IV.  <b>Counsel receiving this notice are directed to serve copy of the notice of hearing on all defendants.</b> (Pezzarossi, Lisa) (Entered: 12/04/2017)
12/05/2017	<u>6</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Anita Johnson on behalf of United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Homeland Security, United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement (Johnson, Anita) (Entered: 12/05/2017)
12/08/2017	<u>7</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice for admission of Lourdes M. Rosado by State of New York.(Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 12/11/2017)
12/08/2017	<u>8</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice for admission of Scott Kaplan by State of Oregon.(Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 12/11/2017)
12/08/2017	<u>9</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice for admission of Chalia Stallings-Ala'ilima by State of Washington.(Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 12/11/2017)
12/08/2017	<u>10</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice for admission of Steven M. Sullivan by State of Maryland.(Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 12/11/2017)
12/08/2017	<u>11</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice for admission of Caitlyn McEllis by State of Illinois.(Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 12/11/2017)
12/08/2017	<u>12</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice for admission of Nathan Blake by State of Iowa.(Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 12/11/2017)
12/08/2017	<u>13</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice for admission of Stella M.L. Kam by State of Hawaii.(Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 12/11/2017)
12/08/2017	<u>14</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice for admission of Robyn R. Bender by District of Columbia.(Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 12/11/2017)

12/12/2017	<u>15</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Sara A. Colb on behalf of Commonwealth of Massachusetts (Colb, Sara) (Entered: 12/12/2017)
12/19/2017	<u>17</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice for admission of Satoshi Yanai by State of California.(Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 12/20/2017)
12/20/2017	<u>16</u>	Judge F. Dennis Saylor, IV: ELECTRONIC ORDER entered granting <u>7</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice ; granting <u>8</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice ; granting <u>9</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice ; granting <u>10</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice ; granting <u>11</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice ; granting <u>12</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice ; granting <u>13</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice ; granting <u>14</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice (Halley, Taylor) Attorneys admitted Pro Hac Vice must register for electronic filing if the attorney does not already have an ECF account in this district. To register go to the Court website at <a href="http://www.mad.uscourts.gov">www.mad.uscourts.gov</a> . Select Case Information, then Electronic Filing (CM/ECF) and go to the CM/ECF Registration Form. (Entered: 12/20/2017)
12/20/2017	<u>18</u>	Judge F. Dennis Saylor, IV: ELECTRONIC ORDER entered granting <u>17</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice Added Satoshi Yanai. <b>Attorneys admitted Pro Hac Vice must register for electronic filing if the attorney does not already have an ECF account in this district. To register go to the Court website at <a href="http://www.mad.uscourts.gov">www.mad.uscourts.gov</a>. Select Case Information, then Electronic Filing (CM/ECF) and go to the CM/ECF Registration Form.</b> (Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 12/20/2017)
12/22/2017	<u>19</u>	Assented to MOTION for Extension of Time to 1/26/2018 to File Answer by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Homeland Security, United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Johnson, Anita) (Entered: 12/22/2017)
01/02/2018	<u>20</u>	ELECTRONIC NOTICE Canceling Hearing. Status conference set for 1/11/2018 is OFF. (Pezzarossi, Lisa) (Entered: 01/02/2018)
01/02/2018	<u>21</u>	Judge F. Dennis Saylor, IV: ELECTRONIC ORDER entered granting <u>19</u> Motion for Extension of Time to Answer: United States Citizenship and Immigration Services answer due 1/26/2018; United States Customs and Border Protection answer due 1/26/2018; United States Department of Homeland Security answer due 1/26/2018; United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement answer due 1/26/2018. (Pezzarossi, Lisa) (Entered: 01/02/2018)
01/02/2018	<u>22</u>	NOTICE of Scheduling Conference Scheduling Conference set for 2/21/2018 02:00 PM in Courtroom 2 before Judge F. Dennis Saylor IV. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Pezzarossi, Lisa) (Entered: 01/02/2018)
01/26/2018	<u>23</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint, by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Homeland Security, United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Johnson, Anita) (Entered: 01/26/2018)
02/15/2018	<u>24</u>	JOINT STATEMENT re scheduling conference . (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Rule 16.1 Certification of the Parties)(Sclarsic, Jonathan) (Entered: 02/15/2018)
02/21/2018	<u>25</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice for admission of Valerie M. Nannery by District of Columbia.(Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 02/21/2018)
02/21/2018	<u>26</u>	Judge F. Dennis Saylor, IV: ELECTRONIC ORDER entered granting <u>25</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice Added Valerie M. Nannery. <b>Attorneys admitted Pro Hac Vice must register for electronic filing if the attorney does not already have an ECF account in this district. To register go to the Court website at <a href="http://www.mad.uscourts.gov">www.mad.uscourts.gov</a>. Select Case Information, then Electronic Filing (CM/ECF) and go to the CM/ECF Registration Form.</b> (Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 02/21/2018)
02/21/2018	<u>28</u>	Electronic Clerk's Notes for proceedings held before Judge F. Dennis Saylor, IV: Scheduling Conference held on 2/21/2018. Case called. Colloquy re: discovery, production of documents and Govt's anticipated deadline for production of 11/30/2018. Court orders rolling production on monthly basis. CIS and Customs and Border Protection completed by 9/30/2018. Court set matter for status.

		NOTICE OF HEARING: Status Conference set for 6/4/2018 03:40 PM in Courtroom 2 before Judge F. Dennis Saylor IV. (Court Reporter: Valerie OHara at vaohara@gmail.com.)(Attorneys present: Sclarsic, Colb, Johnson, Manning) (Pezzarossi, Lisa) (Entered: 04/16/2018)
02/22/2018	27	Filing fee/payment: \$ 100, receipt number 1BST066995 for 26 Order on Motion for Leave to Appear, (Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 02/22/2018)
05/29/2018	<u>29</u>	First MOTION for Extension of Time to N/A to Reschedule Status Conference by Commonwealth of Massachusetts.(Sclarsic, Jonathan) (Entered: 05/29/2018)
05/29/2018	30	Judge F. Dennis Saylor, IV: ELECTRONIC ORDER entered granting <u>29</u> Joint Motion to Reschedule the 6/4/2018 status conference. The Status Conference has been rescheduled for 6/20/2018 02:20 PM in Courtroom 2 before Judge F. Dennis Saylor IV. (Pezzarossi, Lisa) (Entered: 05/29/2018)
06/20/2018	31	Electronic Clerk's Notes for proceedings held before Judge F. Dennis Saylor, IV: Status Conference held on 6/20/2018. Case called. Parties report on status of rolling production. Court set further status for 10/3/2018 at 2:30 PM. (Court Reporter: Valerie OHara at vaohara@gmail.com.)(Attorneys present: J. Sclarsic (ph), Johnson) (Pezzarossi, Lisa) (Entered: 06/21/2018)
07/02/2018	<u>32</u>	NOTICE of Withdrawal of Appearance by Jonathan Sclarsic (Sclarsic, Jonathan) (Entered: 07/02/2018)
08/08/2018	33	ELECTRONIC NOTICE of Hearing. Status Conference set for 10/3/2018 02:30 PM in Courtroom 2 before Judge F. Dennis Saylor IV. (Pezzarossi, Lisa) (Entered: 08/08/2018)
09/21/2018	<u>34</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Kevin W. Manganaro on behalf of Commonwealth of Massachusetts (Manganaro, Kevin) (Entered: 09/21/2018)
10/03/2018	35	Electronic Clerk's Notes for proceedings held before Judge F. Dennis Saylor, IV: Status Conference held on 10/3/2018. Parties reported on document production. Court set further hearing.  NOTICE OF HEARING: Status Conference set for 12/13/2018 03:10 PM in Courtroom 2 before Judge F. Dennis Saylor IV. (Court Reporter: Valerie OHara at vaohara@gmail.com.)(Attorneys present: K. Manganaro, A. Johnson) (Pezzarossi, Lisa) (Entered: 10/11/2018)
12/10/2018	<u>36</u>	Joint MOTION to Continue Status Conference to 1/31/2019 by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services.(Johnson, Anita) (Entered: 12/10/2018)
12/11/2018	37	Judge F. Dennis Saylor, IV: ELECTRONIC ORDER entered granting <u>36</u> Motion to Continue Status Conference set for 1/31/2018 02:30 PM in Courtroom 2 before Judge F. Dennis Saylor IV. (Pezzarossi, Lisa) (Entered: 12/11/2018)
01/03/2019	<u>38</u>	NOTICE of Withdrawal of Appearance by Kevin W. Manganaro (Manganaro, Kevin) (Entered: 01/03/2019)
01/25/2019	39	NOTICE Resetting a Hearing. Due to Government shutdown, the status conference set for 1/31/2019 is OFF. The Status Conference has been rescheduled for 3/7/2019 10:00 AM in Courtroom 2 before Judge F. Dennis Saylor IV. (Pezzarossi, Lisa) (Entered: 01/25/2019)
02/12/2019	40	<b>NEW TIME ONLY</b> -- ELECTRONIC NOTICE OF RESCHEDULING Status Conference RESET for 3/7/2019 09:40 AM in Courtroom 2 before Judge F. Dennis Saylor IV. (Pezzarossi, Lisa) (Entered: 02/12/2019)
02/22/2019	41	<b>TIME CHANGE ONLY</b> ELECTRONIC NOTICE OF RESCHEDULING Status Conference set for 3/7/2019 09:10 AM in Courtroom 2 before Judge F. Dennis Saylor IV. (Pezzarossi, Lisa) (Entered: 02/22/2019)
03/01/2019	<u>42</u>	Joint MOTION to Continue status conference by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services.(Johnson, Anita) (Entered: 03/01/2019)

03/05/2019	<u>43</u>	Judge F. Dennis Saylor, IV: ELECTRONIC ORDER entered granting <u>42</u> Motion to Continue. The 3/7/2019 status conference is OFF.  NOTICE RESETTING HEARING: Status Conference reset for 4/17/2019 03:00 PM in Courtroom 2 before Judge F. Dennis Saylor IV. (Pezzarossi, Lisa) (Entered: 03/05/2019)
03/28/2019	<u>44</u>	NOTICE of Withdrawal of Appearance Attorney Lourdes M Rosado terminated. (Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 04/01/2019)
03/28/2019	<u>45</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice for admission of Conor P. Duffy by Commonwealth of Massachusetts.(Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 04/01/2019)
04/01/2019	<u>46</u>	Judge F. Dennis Saylor, IV: ELECTRONIC ORDER entered granting <u>45</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice Added Conor P. Duffy. <b>Attorneys admitted Pro Hac Vice must register for electronic filing if the attorney does not already have an ECF account in this district. To register go to the Court website at <a href="http://www.mad.uscourts.gov">www.mad.uscourts.gov</a>. Select Case Information, then Electronic Filing (CM/ECF) and go to the CM/ECF Registration Form.</b> (Halley, Taylor) (Entered: 04/01/2019)
04/05/2019	<u>47</u>	Assented to MOTION to Continue status conference to 5/31/2019 or Other Late May Date by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Homeland Security, United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Johnson, Anita) (Entered: 04/05/2019)